SANTACRUZ

ACTION MINUTES

Historic Preservation Commission 7:30 p.m., Wednesday, July 21, 2010 City Council Chambers 809 Center Street

Call to Order Chair Carter called the meeting to order at 7:30 p.m.

Roll Call H. Carter - Chair, I. Blackwood; A. Meyer; F. Miller; J. Steen;

D. Subocz

Absent: K. Eriksen (W/O)

Others: Approximately 25 members of the public

Staff: Senior Planner D. Lauritson, Associate Planner J. Lum and N. Ellis,

Recording Secretary

Presentations – None

Oral Communications – M. Bethke, 229 Union Street, thanked the Historic Preservation Commission for the Certificate of Appreciation award for their house raising which was presented to him and his wife at the Museum of Art & History Blue Plaque Awards Ceremony.

Announcements – None.

Approval of Minutes – May 19, 2010

ACTION: Commissioner Steen moved and Commissioner Meyer seconded, to approve the minutes of May 19, 2010 as amended. The Commission vote was 5/0/1/1/; with Commissioner(s) Subocz abstaining and Eriksen absent.

Public Hearings –

1. 424 Mott Avenue CP10-0056 APN 010-212-15

Historic Alteration Permit for additions and modifications to structures on a property containing two residential units and a detached garage; including variations to setbacks for historic properties. The property is listed on the Historic Building Survey and located in the RL/CZ/H zoning district. (Environmental Review: Categorical Exemption) (Owner/Filed: D. Perkins, Trustee/4-7-10 & 6-10)

Recommendation: That the Historic Preservation Commission acknowledge the environmental determination and approve the Historic Alteration Permit based on the Findings contained in the agenda report and Conditions of Approval in Exhibit "A".

Senior Planner D. Lauritson presented the staff report.

The public hearing was opened.

Speaking from the Floor:

L. Rothfuss, Designer

No one else wished to speak and the public hearing was closed.

Commissioners asked questions and made comments as follows:

- ➤ Eliminate any reference to timing as that will be noted in the Zoning Administrator conditions of approval for the design permit.
- Match the thickness of the siding to the old trim.
- > Should include eaves on rear building where possible.
- ➤ Should include other ways of obtaining a one-hour fire-rated assembly without the use of cement plaster by using sheetrock with hardy plank siding.
- Matching the new roof material with o.g. gutter and round downspouts.
- ➤ Only portion of the building adjacent to side yard would receive covered eaves (5 percent of the whole eave would have a flush overhang with the other a 10 percent overhang).
- Match pickets on railing with original material.

ACTION: Commissioner Subocz moved and Commissioner Steen seconded, to APPROVE with above changes the Historic Alteration Permit at 424 Mott Avenue. The motion passed on a unanimous 6/0/1 vote; with Commissioner Eriksen absent.

2. 335 Union Street CP10-0094 APN 006-401-04

Historic Alteration Permit to construct a two-story addition to an existing single-family dwelling listed on the City Historic Building Survey, to demolish an existing non-historic barn, and to construct a detached garage with second-story ADU on a standard lot in the RL zone district. (Environmental Determination: Categorical Exemption) (Environmental Determination: Categorical Exemption) (Barker Rebecca C W/H Jt et al, owner/filed: 6/8/2010)

JL

Recommendation: That the Historic Preservation Commission acknowledge the environmental determination and approve the Historic Alteration Permit based on the Findings contained in the agenda report and Conditions of Approval in Exhibit "A".

Associate Planner J. Lum presented the staff report. Stephanie Barnes-Castro, project designer, presented the design concepts for the project.

The public hearing was opened.

Speaking from the Floor

- S. Barnes-Castro, Architect
- R. Barker, owner

Speaking from the Floor with Concerns

- N. Humy
- S. Brewer

- J. Michalak
- M. Meady
- L. Serbus
- E. Stumpf
- L. Stumpf
- D. Lavo
- E. Johnson
- S. Scott

The public's concerns for the project were as follows:

- Inconsistent with the purposes of historic preservation as adopted by the City in 2003.
- > The proposed project would not help stabilize and improve the economic value of the historic neighborhood in the 300 block of Union Street.
- > The proposed project does not protect and enhance the City's cultural and aesthetic heritage.
- The proposal does not arise from a need to correct an unsafe or dangerous condition.
- ➤ The proposal does not arise from the need to avoid substantial economic hardship, or from an inability to make reasonable use of the property, but will cause some degree of economic hardship on neighboring properties.
- > The Commission should not allow the demolition of the barn as it is not in keeping with the historic preservation mandate.
- Request keeping the historic nature of the existing house.
- ➤ Keep the small cottage gothic-style structure as it exists.
- > The proposed house addition and new ADU changes the integrity of the street, the view, the character and the historical experience.
- > Observe the original barn footprint and allow the current setbacks as exists.
- The added mass is anachronistic with any other two-story house in the neighborhood.
- > Suggest adding the staircase on the interior of the barn.
- > The new height would block neighboring views and change the entire neighborhood.

Speaking from the Floor in Rebuttal

S. Barnes-Castro, Architect

No one else wished to speak and the public hearing was closed.

After Commission discussion related to details of the house addition and the historic background and value of the existing barn structure, the Commission indicated they would like to continue the application to the following meeting to allow time to address various design issues. The applicant requested that the Commission take some final action on the project.

ACTION: Commissioner Subocz moved and Commissioner Steen seconded, to DENY THE PROJECT WITHOUT PREJUDICE for the Historic Alteration Permit at 335 Union Street as the size and location of the second-story is incompatible with the existing historic house. The motion passed on a 5/1/1 vote; with Commissioner(s) Miller voting no and Eriksen absent.

General Business –

3. January 22, 2010 Letter from Ross Gibson regarding HPC Preservation Action Plan

Recommendation: Discuss letter.

ACTION: Postponed discussion to next Commission meeting.

4. Letter from Ross Gibson regarding Adding Wings onto Small Cottages Recommendation: Discuss letter.

ACTION: Postponed discussion to next Commission meeting.

5. Ad-Hoc Subcommittees for 2010
Recommendation: Receive report from Staff and activate Ad-Hoc Subcommittees.

ACTION: Received report and activated some Ad-Hoc Subcommittees.

The following is a list of selected Ad-Hoc Subcommittees and their respective Commissioner(s) for 2010 as follows:

- ➤ La Bahia Commissioner(s) Subocz, Carter
- > Tannery Arts Project Commissioner(s) Subocz, Blackwood, Miller
- ➤ Volume 3 Commissioner(s) Steen and Eriksen
- **➤** Mills Act Commissioner Subocz

Subcommittee/Advisory Body Oral Reports - None.

Items Initiated by Members for Future Agendas –

> Information regarding current policy and ordinance regarding historic value of detached accessory structures on Historic Building Survey parcels.

At 11:30 p.m. the Commission adjourned to the next regularly scheduled meeting of August 18, 2010 at 7:30 p.m. in the City Council Chambers.

	APPROVED _	
		Hugh Carter, Chair
ATTEST:		
	Don Lauritson Senior Planne	