



**Equal Employment Opportunity
Committee Regular Meeting Minutes
1:30 PM -Thursday - November 13, 2014
City Council Chambers
809 Center Street**

Call to Order

Chair Landers called the meeting to order at 1:37 p.m.

Roll Call

Present: Chair Landers, Vice-Chair Donovan, Member Spickler, Member Guevara, Member Sawyer, Member Simmons

Absent: Member Warren, Member Hubling, Member Kaufman

Staff: Principal HR Analyst McMullen and Administrative Assistant II Arellano

Statements of Disqualification – None

Oral Communications – No action may be taken –

1. Member Guevara gave infographic presentation on Female vs. Male pay gap data at the City of Santa Cruz.
 - Subcommittee started at the granular level to look at classification. The classification level, because there is a 25% spread, appears to be equal.
 - While there are job classifications that could be considered male dominant, there are several examples of female outliers that make more than the male majority in that particular classification.
 - At the granular lever, our step system appears to be working and be an equitable structure.
 - When you get to the bargaining units (Service, Supervisor, Management, Police, Police Management, Fire, Fire Management, Executive, and Temporary), things start shifting.
 - Original ask for this information was based on President Obama's push for the Equal Pay Act which failed in congress. At that time the average in the United States was \$0.78 female dollar to the male dollar. The City is currently performing four cents higher than the national average at \$0.82 female dollar to the male dollar.
 - Female versus Male wages at the City of Santa Cruz, citywide workforce 39% female to 61% male, across the board as an aggregate women make 18% less pay. Based on true hourly rate. Includes the Mayor, Councilmembers, and temporary workers.
 - 18% less is \$.82 to the male dollar, better than the National average.
 - Public Safety is male dominated and well paid positions. If you remove all Public Safety, women make 43% to the non-public safety workforce and pay becomes 7% less pay on average across the City of Santa Cruz.
 - Service Bargaining Unit – 38 % female, 62% male workforce. Average 5% less pay.
 - Supervisor Bargaining Unit – 29% female, 71% male workforce. Average 12% less pay.

Equal Employment Opportunity Committee
Minutes of November 13, 2014 Regular Meeting

- Police Bargaining Unit (based on data before recent hires) – 15% female, 85% male workforce. Average 22% less pay.
 - Police Management Bargaining Unit – 100% male (6 males). Move up to \$72.96 as average true hourly rate.
 - Fire Bargaining Unit – 2% female (1 female), 98% male workforce. Average ½% less pay.
 - Fire Management Bargaining Unit – 100% male (6 males). \$66.38 is average true hourly rate.
 - Management Bargaining Unit – 55% female, 45% male workforce. Average 19% less pay. Higher representation in the unit, but the pay on average is lower with females average true hourly \$40.71 compared to the male average \$50.45.
 - Executive Bargaining Unit – 60% females, 40% males. Highest female majority within the unit, still averages 11% less pay. Excludes Mayor and council members.
 - Temporary Bargaining Unit – 47% females, 53% males workforce. Average 3% less pay.
- Chair Landers brought up the City Classification and Compensation study. If the study does occur before next EEO Committee meeting in February, suggested sharing the gender data pay information with the consultant conducting the study.
 - Our HR Director, Bruce Davis, has left and the new HR Director will be starting on December 8th.
 - Union negotiations are to be held in the spring with the various bargaining units, and they are interested in having the compensation/classification information as well. Negotiations begin the end of January. Should the committee try to have the information ready in time for negotiations, or postpone?
 - Vice-Chair Donovan suggested we need to look at longevity as well when looking at the data. Chair Landers also mentioned starting salaries and if there's a disparity between what level men and women come in at and do men negotiate a higher salary when they come in. In regards to succession planning, are women advancing at the same rates as men, or are they hired directly into management?
 - If they are hired at lower salary, when they are promoted, they will receive the same percentage increase, but on a lower amount because of the lock-in effect of the initial lower entry point.

Announcements - No action may be taken – None

Approval of Minutes

1. Minutes of the September 24, 2014 Special meeting
 - Correction of Minutes:
 - Member Simmons mentioned a correction on page 3 regarding year date on Cultural Diversity classes.

Action

Member Donovan moved, seconded by Member Guevara to approve the Minutes as corrected. The MOTION carried unanimously by Chair Landers, Member Spickler, Member Simmons. Member Sawyer votes to approve, only to the extent that her absence was properly recorded.

Equal Employment Opportunity Committee
Minutes of November 13, 2014 Regular Meeting

General Business

1. Respectful Workplace Policy Ad-Hoc Subcommittee

1. Staff Liaison McMullen

- Chair Landers, Vice-Chair Donovan, Member Guevara, Member Spickler, and Staff Liaison McMullen met to discuss development of a draft Respectful Workplace policy.
- The City of Corvallis', OR policy was placed in the City of Santa Cruz Administrative Procedure Order format. Included in packet is also the two page form used to intake a complaint using the policy.
- The City of Santa Cruz currently does not use a written form for people to file complaints under our Discrimination and Harassment Policy. Two versions were found that were used in the past and presented here as examples.
- Chair Landers asked if the rest of the Committee thinks a Respectful Workplace Policy is needed.
- The current Discrimination and Harassment Policy covers the protected classes, but if you're not a member of a protected class but have something going on that is making you uncomfortable in your workplace, there really is no official mechanism to follow through other than Personnel Rule 8 where you can be disciplined for Disrespectful Treatment.
- Coordinating with the bargaining units, Chair Landers assisted with developing the Respectful Workplace Policy in the City of Corvallis, OR.
- Liaison McMullen said a Respectful Workplace Policy will add HR involvement for those situations which currently are investigated by the departments as issues with misconduct.
- Member Spickler input that the Policy should expand to show examples of how to respond when an employee is the recipient of disrespectful behavior and what actions to take.
- Member Guevara inquired what the timeline of the policy would be in regards to going through the bargaining units, HR, and City Council.
- Chair Landers suggested it would be a good idea to have it approved by the City Council to have that force behind the policy.
- Liaison McMullen inquired if the subcommittee wants to do anything with the Council Policy itself to expand it to include the Respectful Workplace topic. APO's are only approved through the City Manager's office. The new HR Director may want to weigh in on this. It should take 2-3 months.

Action

Vice-Chair Donovan moved, seconded by Member Simmons to move forward. The MOTION carried unanimously by Chair Landers, Members Spickler, Member Sawyer, and Member Guevara.

- The next consideration is whether it should be an Administrative Procedure Order or Council Policy.
- Member Spickler inquired if the policy would include a training component.

○

Equal Employment Opportunity Committee
Minutes of November 13, 2014 Regular Meeting

- Liaison McMullen stated that starting in 2015, under the amended AB1825, Harassment Prevention Training classes must now cover prevention of abusive conduct. The new law did not create a new protected class, but did update the training requirement.
 - Presently, we require every employee to receive Harassment Prevention Training one time. State law requires supervisors and above to receive refresher training every two years. Non-supervisory employees never receive this training again, unless through investigations they find that an employee needs to receive the training again. Establishing a recurring training requirement for all employees could be a possible consideration to better reinforce the City's policy.
 - Chair Landers stated this subcommittee lasts until March 2015. The policy needs a little more work. The subcommittee will meet again to a draft and present it to the full Committee at the February 2015 meeting to consider formally adopting a recommendation to present it to the City Manager or Mayor.
2. 2014 Annual Report Ad-Hoc Subcommittee
- Staff Liaison McMullen
 - McMullen requested assistance in producing the annual report. Member Simmons and Member Sawyer volunteered.
3. Review EEO Committee Goals and Objectives
- Staff Liaison McMullen
 - Annual review of the goals is supposed to take place during the September and November meetings.
 - Chair Landers reviewed goals. Vice-Chair Donovan stated goals have been refined.
 - Member Spickler brought up goal #3 in regards to room for expansion to outside contractors to the City. As a contractor to the City, they have to adhere to the Discrimination Policies that the City has. Possibly obtain an annual report from vendor stating any discrimination suits filed at their business, in order to check that the people we contract with follow our Discrimination Policy.
 - Staff Liaison McMullen suggests reviewing the Goals & Objectives at the next meeting as part of reviewing the entire 2014 Annual Report.

Information Items – No action may be taken

1. Legal Update
- Staff Liaison McMullen
 - No legal update for this meeting
2. Summary of Discrimination Complaint(s) and Outcome(s)
- Staff Liaison McMullen
 - 2014 Complaint Log

○

Equal Employment Opportunity Committee
Minutes of November 13, 2014 Regular Meeting

- Staff Liaison McMullen gave an oral presentation on the Discrimination/Harassment Complaint Log and reviewed the open complaints for 2014.
 - Member Spickler inquired that if it does not specifically state that there was no corrective action taken, do we assume there was no corrective action?
 - McMullen clarified that the corrective action would be listed.
3. Training
- Janice Lum, Training and Development Manager
 - Mandated Training Compliance
 - Harassment Prevention & Cultural Diversity Training
 - Harassment Prevention training classes scheduled for January 22, 2015, two sessions for new employees. Sending notification to supervisors, Councilmembers, and managers due for training.
 - Cultural Diversity classes scheduled for February 19, 2015, two sessions.
 - Succession Planning
 - Met with Department Heads on October 1, 2014
 - Presented preliminary workforce data.
 - Out of 700 employees, 28% are eligible for retirement now, 45% will be eligible for retirement in the next 5 years.
 - Presented potential approach for succession planning to the department heads. Included workforce analysis and determining the structure of the program. Suggested forming a sub-committee of Department Heads.
 - Training managers on how to have development conversations with their employees and talking to them about their individual development plans.
 - Make performance evaluations a developmental tool.
 - Possibility of creating employee engagement survey.
 - Employee recognition program.
 - Looking at the next round of Employee Leadership courses to see if they will stay the same or whether the content will be changed.
 - Next meeting they will look to setting priorities for the program.

Subcommittee/Advisory Body Oral Reports

1. Access to Employment Job Fair Committee
 - Lori Fukuda, HR Analyst
 - Access2Employment Job Fair
 - Held October 22, 2014.
 - 40 employers in attendance, 19 agencies, 320 job seekers.
 - Positive feedback from attendees.
 - Cathy Bonino, Principal HR Analyst and Elysa Jauregui, HR Technician both staffed a City booth at the Job Fair and reported that attendance of job seekers was lower than in previous years.

Equal Employment Opportunity Committee Minutes of November 13, 2014 Regular Meeting

- Emphasis of the Job Fair Committee was focused on employers as opposed to job seekers; there could have been more outreach to job seekers.
- The Job Fair Committee is proposing a job fair to be held on March 22, 2015.
- Members of the EEO Committee have served on the Job Fair Committee as the City's representative in previous years. The responsibility falls to HR staff if no one from the EEO Committee volunteers to serve. McMullen will send an email soliciting for a volunteer to serve on the 2015 Job Fair Committee.
- Member Guevara mentioned that there could be a consolidated service that can provide information of a wide variety of jobs. Face-to-Face job fairs supplemented by online resources to maximize outreach and networking.
- Virtual job fairs are becoming more common.
- Monterey job fair held 2-3 times a year is very well attended and a lot more employers show up.
- Post job fair on www.cruzcal.org, Santa Cruz County Arts and Events community based calendar.
- Project for Innovation and Entrepreneurship with UCSC for interns. Connect with talent from UCSC so that they feel welcomed by our community.

2. Outreach Rotating Ad-Hoc Sub-Committee

- Member Guevara
 - Book Club
 - The book Brag! is related to pay disparity and pay negotiations.
 - Outreach
 - Need to find out the next quarterly meeting in January 2015.
 - Present Respectful Workplace Policy for following meeting in March or July.
 - Chair Landers will send out department head survey on regular staff meetings.

Items Initiated by Members for Future Agendas

- Respectful Workplace ad-hoc subcommittee report
- Gender Pay Equity
- Outreach
- 2014 Annual Report
 - Goals and Objectives action steps

Action Adjournment

At 3:03 pm Chair Landers adjourned the meeting to the next regularly scheduled meeting on Thursday February 12, 2015 at 1:30 p.m. in Council Chambers.

Additional Information

Visit the City's Web Site at <http://www.cityofsantacruz.com/> for information about City Advisory Body Meeting Agendas and Minutes, Advisory Body information and the Santa Cruz Municipal Code. Sign up to receive automatic notification when meetings are announced and Agendas are posted.