

MINUTES
Historic Preservation Commission
Special Meeting
7:30 p.m., Wednesday, March 4, 2009
City Council Chambers
809 Center Street

The following is an unofficial representation of the Historic Preservation Commission Actions. Minutes are official upon approval

Call to Order 7:40 P.M.

Roll Call – D. Subocz, Chair; K. Eriksen; H. Carter; R. Gibson; A. Meyer;
C. Shultes; J. Steen

Present – D. Subocz, Chair; K. Eriksen; H. Carter; R. Gibson; A. Meyer; C. Shultes; J. Steen

Staff – J. Rebagliati, Planning Director; E. Marlatt, Principal Planner; D. Lauritson, Senior Planner; M. Schwarb & S. Randolph, Records

Audience – Approximately 16

Statements of Disqualification – None

Oral Communications – No action shall be taken

Ed Silveira spoke regarding Villa Branciforte.

Announcements – No action shall be taken – None

The Chair may announce and set time limits at the beginning of each agenda item.

Public Hearing

- | | | | |
|--|----------------------|---------------|---------------------------|
| 1. | 215 Beach St. | 06-004 | APN 005-213-02, 03 |
| <p>Environmental Impact Report, Historic Demolition Permit, Historic Building Survey Deletion, for “La Bahia” Hotel Project – Demolition of an existing 44-unit apartment complex building listed on the City Historic Building Survey and construction of a 125-room hotel with a restaurant, meeting space, and a partially underground garage in the RTC/HO/CZ/SPO zoning district. (Environmental Determination: EIR) (Barry Swenson Builders, owner/filed: 1/6/06) DL</p> <p>This project requires a Local Coastal Plan/Program Amendment and Coastal Permit which must be approved by the California Coastal Commission after all possible appeals are exhausted through the City.</p> | | | |

Recommendation: That the Historic Preservation Commission make recommendations to the City Council regarding:

- **Certification of the project EIR;**
- **Approval of an Historic Demolition Permit;**
- **Approval of an Historic Survey Deletion.**

Senior Planner Don Lauritson presented the staff report.

Jessie Nickell and Jeff Current of Barry Swenson Builders presented the project.

The Public Hearing was opened.

SPEAKING FROM THE FLOOR:

Chris Fitz
Ed Silveira
Ned Van Valkenburgh
Mark Jaffee
Will Roblin
Mike Brazil
Michael Bethke

The Public Hearing was closed.

Commissioners voiced the following:

- Demolition permits are typically keyed to an approved replacement project and there is no detailed final design.
- Too much mass and too many flaws in the project design.
- Lack of legitimate historic preservation components.
- Auto court entry is contrary to the B/SOL Plan and will create traffic congestion on Beach St.
- Hill Village architectural approach is not followed.
- Demolition of the building should be last resort and reconstruction in kind should be considered.
- Current condition of the building has been neglected by the owners and continued to decline.
- Project needs to be cleaned up and simplified to be more pleasing.
- How could the Commission be assured that supporting the project would give them an opportunity for input?
- Lack of trust that the project's developer will listen to and respect the opinions of the HPC design sub-committee.
- The applicant has listened to the subcommittee and has responded in a positive manner.

Some of the Commissioners expressed interest in seeing the project move forward with more input from the HPC regarding the design.

For the record, Commissioner Shultes noted that if the project were being rebuilt in-kind he felt the voting would be different.

ACTION: Commissioner Carter moved and Commissioner Gibson seconded that the Historic Preservation Commission recommend that the City Council certify the project EIR with prejudice. The motion passed unanimously; Chair Subocz and Commissioners Eriksen, Carter, Gibson, Meyer, Shultes and Steen in favor.

ACTION: Commissioner Gibson moved and Commissioner Carter seconded that the Historic Preservation Commission recommend that the City Council deny the Historic Demolition Permit which is only issued when an appropriate replacement project is approved. The motion passed on a vote of 5/2 with Commissioners Carter, Eriksen, Gibson, Meyer and Steen in favor, Chair Subocz and Commissioner Shultes opposed.

ACTION: Commissioner Shultes moved and Commissioner Carter seconded that the Historic Preservation Commission APPROVE forwarding Historic Preservation Commission recommendations on the replacement project. The motion passed unanimously. Chair Subocz and Commissioners Eriksen, Carter, Gibson, Meyer, Shultes and Steen in favor.

Specific recommendations from the HPC to be included in the replacement project include:

1. RECONSTRUCTION IN-KIND OF THE BELL TOWER WING ON BEACH STREET;
2. RECONSTRUCTION IN-KIND OF THE COURT OF THE TROUBADOURS FROM WESTBROOK AVENUE INTO THE COURT OF THE LAURELS;
3. RECONSTRUCTION IN-KIND OF THE FIRST FLOOR OF THE WESTBROOK WING ALLOWING FOR A TWO-STORY ADDITION ABOVE;
4. RECONSTRUCTION OF THE CHARACTER-DEFINING FEATURES OF THE COURT OF THE LAURELS TO INCLUDE OCTAGONAL STAIRS, MAINTAINING THE IMMEDIATE LINE OF PARAPETS, WALLS, AND A SIGNIFICANT PORTION OF THE NATURAL DAYLIGHTING;
5. FAITHFUL RECONSTRUCTION OF AS MANY COMPONENTS OF THE EXISTING BUILDINGS AS POSSIBLE;

6. PRESERVATION OR RECONSTRUCTION-IN KIND OF THE MAJORITY OF THE BEACH STREET FAÇADE EXCLUDING THE FLAT ROOF SECTION;
7. SUGGEST THAT THE HPC LA BAHIA SUBCOMMITTEE AND MEMBERS OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION AND CITY COUNCIL WORK WITH THE DEVELOPERS THROUGH DESIGN DEVELOPMENT;
8. IF DELISTING IS TO OCCUR, IT SHOULD ONLY OCCUR AFTER A CERTIFICATE OF OCCUPANCY IS OBTAINED FOR THE REPLACEMENT STRUCTURE AFTER IT IS FINALED.

ACTION: Commissioner Gibson moved and Commissioner Carter seconded that the Historic Preservation Commission recommend that the City Council deny approval of the Historic Survey Deletion of this NR2 eligible landmark. The motion passed unanimously with Chair Subocz and Commissioners Eriksen, Carter, Gibson, Meyer, Shultes and Steen in favor.

ACTION: Commissioner Carter moved and Commissioner Gibson seconded that the La Bahia Subcommittee prepare a letter to the City Council expanding and clarifying the evening's deliberations. The motion passed unanimously with Chair Subocz and Commissioners Eriksen, Carter, Gibson, Meyer, Shultes and Steen in favor.

Adjournment –

At 11:40 p.m. The Historic Preservation Commission adjourned to the next regular meeting of March 18, 2009 in the Council Chambers.

APPROVED:

Dated

David Subocz, Chair

ATTEST:

Dated

Don Lauritson, Secretary