

MEMORANDUM

DATE May 23, 2022 PROJECT 22103
NUMBER

TO Clara Stanger, Senior Planner
cstanger@cityofsantacruz.com PROJECT 126 Eucalyptus Avenue, Santa Cruz

OF City of Santa Cruz Planning &
Community Development Dept.
809 Center Street, Room 101
Santa Cruz, CA 95060 FROM Josh Bevan, AICP
Cultural Resources Planner
bevan@page-turnbull.com
Ruth Todd, FAIA, AICP, Principal
Page & Turnbull, Principal
ruth todd@page-turnbull.com

CC Roger Bernstein, Vice President of
Development, Oppidan
roger@oppidan.com VIA Email
Shannon Rusk, Senior Vice President of
Development, Oppidan
shannon@oppidan.com

REGARDING 126 Eucalyptus Avenue, Santa Cruz – Project Analysis

INTRODUCTION

The City of Santa Cruz has requested a Project Analysis for the proposed “126 Eucalyptus” project at 126 Eucalyptus Avenue to determine whether the project will cause a significant impact to historical resources under the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). This memorandum provides a summary of the significance and character-defining features of known historic resources on the property, a project description, and analyzes the proposed project’s compliance with the *Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties*, specifically the *Standards for Rehabilitation*. 126 Eucalyptus Avenue is located on parcel 004-571-02, an approximately seven-acre parcel bordered at the east by West Cliff Drive, at the south by Pelton Avenue, at the west by several private residential properties and Eucalyptus Avenue, and to the north by private residential properties. Parcel 004-571-02 is currently owned by the Oblates of St. Joseph.

126 Eucalyptus Avenue Site

126 Eucalyptus Avenue contains two buildings: the first building (referred to hereafter as Building 1) was relocated to its existing site ca. 1955-1957 and was used as a refectory for a Catholic seminary operated by the Oblates of St. Joseph, before being converted to use as a classroom for private schools that occupied the site between 1971 and 2019. The second building (referred to hereafter as Building 2) was built in 1961 and was designed to provide dormitories, classrooms, a library, and administrative offices for the seminary's school. Building 2 also was occupied between 1971 and 2019 by private schools. Both buildings have been vacant since 2019. These buildings were evaluated by Page & Turnbull in May 2022 and were found individually ineligible for listing on the National Register of Historic Places, California Register of Historical Resources, or the Santa Cruz Historic Building Survey. Additionally, Page & Turnbull determined that the buildings did not appear to be eligible as contributors to any existing or potential historic districts.

544 West Cliff Drive Site

544 West Cliff Drive contains two previously identified local historical resources. The first, Rutherglen Terrace, was built in 1893 and is a prominent residence designed in a hybridized Colonial Revival-Queen Anne style (**Figure 1 and Figure 2**). The Rutherglen Terrace site also contains a detached carriage house, now used for storage, built ca. 1893 (**Figure 3 and Figure 4**). These buildings were acquired by the Oblates of St. Joseph in 1933 for use as a seminary and retreat location. The second, the neighboring Davis House, was built in 1912 and was designed in a hybrid Mediterranean-Prairie style (**Figure 5 and Figure 6**). The Davis House was acquired by the Oblates of St. Joseph in 1951 as their seminary use expanded. Finally, the 544 West Cliff Drive site contains the Shrine of St. Joseph Guardian of the Redeemer, which was originally constructed in 1951 as a one-story vernacular chapel. The building was extensively remodeled in 1993 to its current approximately two-story, gabled form with a contemporary appearance. Subsequent alterations to the Shrine's north wing to provide a café use were recently completed. This building was not identified as a potential historic resource given its relatively recent remodeling and the notable change in its overall architectural character, effectively representing a 1993 design rather than a 1951 building (**Figure 7 to Figure 10**).



Figure 1: Rutherglen Terrace, with the Davis House in the left background, looking southwest.



Figure 2: Rutherglen Terrace viewed from landscaped area to the southwest with statue of St. Joseph Morello, looking northeast.



Figure 3: Carriage house to the rear of Rutherglen Terrace, looking northwest.



Figure 4: View of the rear of the carriage house, looking northeast.



Figure 5: Davis House, primary façade, looking southwest.



Figure 6: Rear façade of the Davis House, looking east.



Figure 7: Primary façade of the Shrine of St. Joseph Guardian of the Redeemer, looking west. Building 2 at 126 Eucalyptus is partially visible in the background.



Figure 8: North side of the Shrine's site, looking south.



Figure 9: Rear façade of the Shrine, looking east.



Figure 10: Garden with statuary and walking path located to the rear of the Shrine, looking southwest.

SUMMARY OF HISTORIC SIGNIFICANCE AND CHARACTER-DEFINING FEATURES

A specific list of identified character-defining features¹ for Rutherglen Terrace and the Davis House was not provided in any previous evaluations for the either historic residential building. Page & Turnbull has compiled the following list based on review of previous survey and written documentation (*Santa Cruz Historic Building Survey, Volume I* and *The Sidewalk Guide to Santa Cruz Architecture*) explaining the significance of each building, as well as observations made during a site visit to 544 West Cliff Drive on April 19, 2022.

Rutherglen Terrace

Rutherglen Terrace is a two-and-a-half story residence designed by Santa Cruz-based architect Edward L. Van Cleeck, built in 1893 for James and Louis McNeil. James McNeil was principal owner and president of the Santa Cruz Electric Light and Power Works. The residence is identified by the *Historic Building Survey* as an early example of the use of the Colonial Revival style in Santa Cruz and features a rounded corner tower identified as a “vestige” of the then outgoing Queen Anne style.² Rutherglen Terrace received a survey rating of “Exceptional,” meaning the residence is categorized within the highest tier of buildings in Santa Cruz in terms of architectural merit.

Rutherglen Terrace’s site, originally a private residential property, also contains a detached two-story wood-frame carriage house with an approximate construction date of 1893. The carriage house is considered a related ancillary building that contributes to the overall significance of Rutherglen Terrace.

Character-Defining Features

- Two-and-half-story height
- Hip roof with wide hipped dormer on primary façade
- Two-story rounded corner bay with conical roof (Queen Anne style)
- Angled bay windows (Queen Anne style)
- Entry portico with combination of square, tapered columns, and composite columns with partial fluting, wreath ornamentation, and entry steps
- Wood entrance door with sidelites
- Second-story balcony with balustrade

¹ For a property to be eligible for national or state designation, the essential physical features (or character-defining features) that enable the property to convey its historic identity must be evident. To be eligible, a property must clearly contain enough of those characteristics, and these features must also retain a sufficient degree of integrity. Characteristics can be expressed in terms such as form, proportion, structure, plan, style, or materials.

² Survey 39.

- Original double-hung, wood-sash windows with ogee lugs molded sills and wood surrounds
- Mixed cladding materials (typical of Queen Anne style): lapped wood siding at first story and shingle siding at second story
- Molded wood trim
- Circular wraparound porch at the northeast corner and recessed side entrance porch at south side of the building (Queen Anne style)
- Chimneys
- Circular entrance driveway on West Cliff Drive
- Detached carriage house
 - Existing position situated to the rear of Rutherglen Terrace
 - Rectangular footprint
 - Hip roof with moderate overhang and exposed rafters
 - Double-hung, wood-sash windows with ogee lugs, molded wood sills, and wood surrounds
 - Lapped wood siding and wood corner boards

Davis House

The Davis House is a two-story, wood-frame residence designed by Oakland-based architect Chester Miller and built in 1912 for Francis H. Davis, a plant manager of the Santa Cruz Portland Cement Company. The residence blends elements of the Prairie and Mediterranean styles and is rated “Good” by the Santa Cruz Historic Building Survey. In terms of architectural features the *Historic Building Survey* describes:

A successful blend of the Prairie and Mission Revival styles with a shallow hip roof, wide overhanging eaves, an open loggia on the second floor, and a walled terrace.³

Character-Defining Features

- Two-story height and rectangular footprint
- Nearly flat hip roof with wide eave overhangs and exposed, molded rafters
- Symmetrical primary façade with bracketed entry hood and second-story inset balcony (open loggia)
- Original window locations (many windows appear to be vinyl-sash replacements)
- Bracketed and molded boxes beneath second story windows
- Smooth stucco exterior
- Side porch at first story, north façade

³ Survey 39.

PROPOSED PROJECT DESCRIPTION

This project description is based upon project plans prepared by CallisonRTKL entitled "The Watermark at Santa Cruz," dated October 15, 2021. These plans are referred to as "Watermark Santa Cruz – Resubmittal Plans 10-15-21" on the City's website for the project.⁴

The project proposes demolition of Buildings 1 and 2, and the related ancillary structures and landscaping within the 126 Eucalyptus Avenue site. The project will also demolish an existing non-historic garden area with a curvilinear pathway and statuary to the rear of the Shrine of St. Joseph Guardian of the Redeemer at 544 West Cliff Drive. This area of the 544 West Cliff Drive site was constructed in early 2006. The existing statuary will be relocated to the circular landscaped area in front of the chapel. Additionally, the existing parcel encompassing the 126 Eucalyptus Avenue and 544 West Cliff Drive sites will be partitioned, creating separate legal parcels for the religious complex and the proposed housing development. These changes are proposed to accommodate the development of a two-building senior housing complex called The Watermark at Santa Cruz. Each building will be two stories tall. The project does not propose any direct alterations to the Shrine or the identified historic resources at 544 West Cliff Drive: Rutherglen Terrace and the Davis House.

Building A

Building A is proposed as a two-story pavilion plan (essentially the shape of an H) building situated on the southern two-thirds of the site. The building will provide assisted living services and include one- and two-bedroom suites placed along double-loaded corridors. This building will also provide a main lobby area and amenity areas serving the residents, including fitness, salon, multi-purpose, café and dining, a kitchen, and property management offices.

As detailed on the annotated landscape plan (sheet L-2), Building A will also feature outdoor courtyards in the recessed areas of the H footprint, including a social courtyard at the east side and a fountain courtyard at the west side. A meditation garden will be located at the southwest corner of the building. An Activity Lawn with a rectangular footprint will be located between Building A and Building B to the north.

Building B

Building B is proposed as a two-story building with a much smaller, generally rectangular footprint and will provide memory care units, office, and dining facilities. This building will be formed from two wings connected by a hyphen and situated toward the northern end of the site. Outdoor

⁴ <https://www.cityofsantacruz.com/government/city-departments/planning-and-community-development/planning-division/active-planning-applications-and-status/significant-project-applications/126-eucalyptus-ave>.

features include a dog park at the far northeast corner of the site, a memory care garden to the immediate east of Building B, and a resident garden to the west of Building B, buffering the building from Eucalyptus Avenue.

Circulation

The Watermark complex will feature a main entrance for vehicles and pedestrians on the north side of Pelton Avenue. The driveway at this entrance will access parking located immediately to the south of Building A, circulating northward to a port cochere (covered car area extending from primary entrance) before circulating west and then to the south, returning toward the driveway entrance. Some parking stalls will be located to the immediate southwest of the Shrine. These stalls will be separated from the rear of the Shrine by a sidewalk, lawn, and trees. The driveway will also provide connection to the existing parking lot to the immediate south of the Shrine and provide eight new parking spaces. To the immediate west of the driveway entrance, a linear paved walkway with a wood trellis of similar design to the port cochere's trellis will lead northward toward Building A, bisecting the parking lot and intersecting the port cochere. Together, the pathway and port cochere form an entry loggia.

Linear pathways paved with cast concrete will be placed around the new buildings' perimeters with adjacent planting beds or trees.

Exterior Features of Proposed Buildings

The proposed buildings are rendered with painted stucco exteriors, rectangular window and balcony openings, wood trellises at balconies, arched openings along portions of the first story, and exterior staircases with solid walls that lend the new buildings a contemporary Mediterranean or Spanish Colonial Revival-inspired appearance. Windows will have aluminum mullions and frames with a dark bronze finish.

STANDARDS FOR REHABILITATION COMPLIANCE

The following discussion considers the proposed project's potential effects on the historic status of, and compatibility with, the historic residences 544 West Cliff Drive, and provides comments on whether the project appears to adhere to the ten *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation*.

- 1. A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.**

The proposed project will not affect the existing uses of Rutherglen Terrace or the Davis House. These former single-family residences have been occupied for residential use by the Oblates of St. Joseph since 1933 and 1951, respectively. Residential uses will continue. The proposed residential project will not cause any existing features of either historic residence to be altered.

Thus, the project complies with Rehabilitation Standard 1.

2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

The historic character of the property will be retained and preserved in the proposed project. Since 1933, alterations to Rutherglen Terrace have related to the building's subsequent uses as a seminary and residence for the Oblates of St. Joseph. Historic character of the property is expressed by the shared spatial relationship between Rutherglen Terrace and the carriage house on the site, the historic and character-defining materials of the residence, and Rutherglen Terrace's relationship to West Cliff Drive, including its circular driveway. These features will not be impacted by the proposed project.

The Davis House's frontage along West Cliff Drive has been altered by the removal of an original driveway, with the portion of the site adjacent to West Cliff Drive now a lawn. The existing character-defining features of the residence will not be impacted by the proposed project. Thus, the project complies with Rehabilitation Standard 2.

3. Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.

No conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings will be added to the proposed buildings at 126 Eucalyptus Avenue. Thus, the project complies with Rehabilitation Standard 3.

4. Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.

Rutherglen Terrace and the Davis House were not assigned a period of significance when they were surveyed and deemed architecturally significant. Each building's significance is tied to its architectural merit in relation to its original design and association with prominent architects. Therefore, a period of significance of 1893 is appropriate for Rutherglen Terrace and 1912 is appropriate for the Davis House. No changes or additions have occurred since each building's

construction that have acquired historic significance in their own right. Further, the proposed project does not propose to alter either historic residence. Thus, the project complies with Rehabilitation Standard 4.

5. Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.

As described in Standard 2, distinctive features, finishes, and examples of craftsmanship will be preserved in their entirety at each historic residence. Thus, the project is in compliance with Rehabilitation Standard 5.

6. Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

The project does not include any scope for repair, replacement, or other alterations to Rutherglen Terrace or the Davis House. Thus, the project complies with Rehabilitation Standard 6.

7. Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.

The project does not include any physical or chemical treatments to clean or remove historic materials or finishes. Thus, the project complies with Rehabilitation Standard 7.

8. Significant archeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken.

Excavation will be required for laying foundations for the new buildings at 126 Eucalyptus Avenue, relocation of the non-historic garden area to the rear of Shrine, and for general site preparation and construction of driveways along Pelton Avenue. Some religious sites include burial grounds; however, the project site is not known to contain former burial sites. Nonetheless, with excavation, even if relatively shallow, discovery of archaeological materials may be possible. Provided that standard discovery procedures for the City of Santa Cruz are followed, the proposed project will adhere to Rehabilitation Standard 8.

9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.

Per the discussion in Standards 2 and 5, the proposed project includes the demolition of two buildings at 126 Eucalyptus Avenue that are not eligible as historic resources (Buildings 1 and 2) and construction of two new two-story buildings, a driveway, parking lots, and new landscaping and hardscaped pathways on the 126 Eucalyptus Avenue site. The project site is adjacent to (west of) 544 West Cliff Drive, which contains two identified historic resources, Rutherglen Terrace and the Davis House. The proposed project includes no direct alterations to either historic building, nor either building's immediate site.

The proposed buildings at 126 Eucalyptus Avenue will be two stories tall with flat roofs. The new construction will be physically detached and well set back from the identified historic residences. As illustrated in renderings provided in the plan set, the new buildings will be partially visible from West Cliff Drive, primarily when facing east through the driveway and parking lot that separates the Shrine and the Davis House. Otherwise, the new buildings will be more visible from Pelton Avenue and from Eucalyptus Avenue. The proposed new buildings do not appear to reduce visibility of any of the character-defining features of Rutherglen Terrace or the Davis House and do not appear to impair the ability of either historic residence to remain visible from West Cliff Drive, which has served as the primary roadway for each residence throughout their existence.

Separation of the new development at 126 Eucalyptus Avenue from 544 West Cliff Drive by a six-foot tall split-faced concrete block wall appears to be compatible with the existing spatial relationships shared between the two residences and does not appear to impact any identified character-defining features of either residence. The architectural character of the new buildings is generally compatible with the existing materials and scale of the residences. The two-story height and flat-roofed profile of the new construction, with contemporary Mediterranean influences, does not appear to overpower the historic buildings, with the new construction remaining visually subordinate.

Thus, the project complies with Rehabilitation Standard 9.

10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

New construction at 126 Eucalyptus Avenue is proposed be undertaken in a way that preserves the existing form and integrity of Rutherglen Terrace and the Davis House. The project does not propose

alterations to either historic residence. The new construction could be removed in the future, and the characteristics that embody each resource's historic significance would not be affected. Thus, the project is in compliance with Rehabilitation Standard 10.

CONCLUSION

As the above analysis demonstrates, the proposed project, as currently designed, is in full compliance with each of the 10 *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation*, and substantially in compliance with three of the Standards. Thus, the proposed project will not affect the ability of Rutherglen Terrace and the Davis House, both addressed 544 West Cliff Drive, to remain listed in the *Santa Cruz Historic Building Survey*, which qualifies the residences as historical resources under CEQA. Per CEQA Guidelines Section 15126.4(b)(1), if a project complies with the *Standards for Rehabilitation*, the project's impact "will generally be considered mitigated below a level of significance and thus is not significant." As the proposed project is in overall compliance with the *Standards for Rehabilitation*, the project will not cause a substantial adverse change in the significance of the resources as defined by CEQA.

QUALIFICATIONS

Page & Turnbull was established in 1973 as Charles Hall Page & Associates to provide architectural and conservation services for historic buildings, resources, and civic areas. The company was one of the first architecture firms in California to dedicate its practice to historic preservation and is among the longest practicing such firms in the country. Offices are located in Los Angeles, Sacramento, San Francisco, and San Jose, and staff includes licensed architects, designers, architectural historians, conservators, and planners. All of Page & Turnbull's professional staff members meet or exceed the Secretary of the Interior's Historic Preservation Professional Qualification Standards.

As an architectural historian and cultural resources planner within Page & Turnbull's Cultural Resources Planning Studio, Josh Bevan, AICP, meets the Secretary of the Interior's Professional Qualification Standards for Architectural History. He is experienced in surveying, researching, and evaluating historic properties, as well as analyzing proposed projects for potential impacts to historic resources.